HEART-FASTING, FORGETTING, AND USING THE HEART LIKE A MIRROR: APPLIED EMPTINESS IN THE ZHUANGZI

Chris Fraser

Introduction

Bohun Wuren had such unshakeable composure that he could lecture the Daoist worthy Liezi on personal cultivation while standing with his heels over the edge of a precipice (21/57–61). His students included even Zichan, chief minister of Zheng, among the most renowned political figures of the age (5/14). Ai Tai Tuo was astonishingly ugly and possessed no special power, wealth, knowledge, or initiative. Yet he projected such charisma that people found him compellingly attractive and trustworthy. Less than a year after he arrived at court, Duke Ai of Lu appointed him prime minister (5/31–49). Wang Tai was a one-footed exconvict who attracted half the state of Lu as his followers. Confucius himself resolved to become his disciple. Without any explicit teachings, he set others aright; people "went to him empty and returned full" (5/1–13). Dongguo Shunzi was a man so authentic he could enlighten others and change their intentions merely by adjusting his bearing. "Clear and tolerant of things," he had "the looks of a person but the emptiness of Nature." Just hearing about him left the ruler of Wei speechless and transfixed (21/1–7).

These and other depictions of ethical adepts in the classical Daoist anthology *Zhuangzi* 莊子 illustrate a eudaimonistic ideal focused on developing and applying distinctively

¹ Citations to the Zhuangzi give chapter and line numbers in Zhuangzi (1956). These indices may be used to find passages in the electronic version of the text available at the Chinese Text Project (http://ctext.org/zhuangzi). Note that, although they may mention historical figures, the Zhuangzi anecdotes cited in this paragraph are likely fictional.

human "virtuosity" (*de* 德). In previous publications,² I have argued that for many of the writings collected in the *Zhuangzi*, the exercise of virtuosity (*de*) in a mode of activity the texts call "wandering" (*you* 遊) constitutes the fullest expression of human agency. Unlike pursuit of a single, fixed *dao* 道 (way, course, path), wandering (*you*) involves meandering through life without a fixed destination—discovering, exploring, shifting between, and playing along various paths, flexibly adapting to circumstances and "riding along with things" (4/52–53) without depending on any one thing in particular (1/21). In this essay, I apply an analytic framework introduced by Foucault (1988) to focus on dimensions of these Zhuangist ethical ideals that have received relatively little attention. Foucault distinguishes between three aspects of what he calls "morality" (1988, 25–28): a moral code, or substantive values and norms; the actual conduct of persons living under some moral code; and what he calls "ethics," namely "the set of attitudes, practices, and goals" by which agents guide their self-fashioning activities as subjects committed to the moral code in question (O'Leary 2002, 11). "Ethics" for Foucault's purposes is thus a subset of morality dealing with questions of practice, self-cultivation, and self-constitution rather than directly with normative issues.

Much research on the *Zhuangzi*—my own included—has focused on the substantive content of Zhuangist views: what positions, norms, or values do various writings in the anthology critique or defend? What *dao* or way of life do they present or endorse? What are the grounds for their stance? In Foucault's framework, these questions concern "morality" but not "ethics." Here I will temporarily set aside such questions to inquire instead into what Foucault would consider the "ethical" side of Zhuangist thought. How does the *Zhuangzi* depict the ethical adept's process of self-constitution? By what course or regimen does an agent become a *dao*-virtuoso like the idealized figures described above? How can agents who commit to the Zhuangist path employ or develop their virtuosity (*de*) so as to engage in a life

² See Fraser (2014) and (2011, 102–103).

of wandering (you)? In light of this volume's theme, one might propose—only partly tongue-in-cheek—that Zhuangist ethics, in Foucault's sense, revolves around nothing. More precisely, I will suggest that the crux of the practical process by which one becomes a Zhuangist adept lies in attaining a blank, clear, or open psychological state, typically denoted by the word "xu 虚" (empty, blank, insubstantial). The chief technique for attaining emptiness (xu) is "forgetting" (wang 忘). Agents who successfully "forget" and attain the empty (xu) state are able to apply their heart "like a mirror" ($ruo\ jing\$ 若鏡). This mirror-like functioning facilitates a life of virtuosity (de) and wandering (you).

The first section below introduces Foucault's analytic model and sketches how it might be applied to a version of Zhuangist ethics. The ensuing section explores a Zhuangist version of one particular element in the Foucauldian framework, the "ethical work." In particular, I consider accounts in the *Zhuangzi* of the practices, techniques, and processes by which an agent may become an ethical adept. The subsequent section briefly compares and contrasts Zhuangist emptiness with the concept of "flow" in positive psychology. The final section considers potential shortcomings of this picture of ethical work, given Zhuangist ethical ends. I will suggest that, provided we remain aware of the limitations of the Zhuangist approach, it is likely to prove fruitful for its intended purpose.

The Foucauldian Framework

Foucault identifies four major elements implicated in the activity of constituting ourselves as ethical agents (1984, 1988). These are the ethical substance, the mode of subjection, the ethical work, and the *telos*.³ The "ethical substance" refers to the part of the agent that is the object of ethical work or training. This object could be one's desires, feelings, acts, or motives, for instance. The "mode of subjection" refers to the manner in which agents see

themselves as relating to moral norms. Agents could see themselves as subjects of a divine command, for example, or as rational beings who act from respect for duty as determined by the Kantian categorical imperative. The "ethical work" refers to the practices or techniques by which agents transform themselves to achieve conformity to moral norms and become ethical adepts. The "telos" of an ethics is the ideal toward which the ethical work is directed—the goal of the agent's self-cultivation.

methodological point. The *Zhuangzi* is a diverse collection of writings. Passages with implications concerning the objects, grounds for, processes, and outcomes of ethical self-development are scattered throughout its many constituent texts, and these very probably present a variety of distinct ethical standpoints. This observation holds not only for texts that are fairly obviously doctrinally heterogeneous, but even for regions of the anthology that some scholars consider relatively homogenous, such as the seven "inner" books. A thorough study of the *Zhuangzi* would meticulously explore the doctrinal similarities and differences between its various parts, but such a detailed treatment is beyond the scope of this essay. What I will attempt instead is to explicate and critically examine a hypothetical Zhuangist position constructed from prominent themes—such as virtuosity (*de*), wandering (*you*), emptiness (*xu*), and forgetting (*wang*)—that appear repeatedly across a selection of doctrinally related passages drawn mainly from the "inner" books (books 1–7) and the cluster of six books (17–22) that Graham dubbed the "School of Zhuangzi" writings (1981, 28). I make no claim that the resulting set of views constitutes *the* unique, overarching Zhuangist

³ For a detailed discussion, see O'Leary (2002, 12–13).

⁴ For instance, the "primitivist" writings of Books 8 and 9 take up a doctrinal stance patently unlike that of the "perspectivalist" "Autumn Waters" dialogue (17/1–53). To cite just one example, the former but not the latter appeal to a normatively charged notion of people's inherent *xing* 性 (nature).

⁵ The ethical ideal of the "authentic man" depicted in the opening lines of Book 6 (6/1-20), for instance, may well diverge from the "cultivating life" ideal presented in the story of Cook Ding, who follows *dao* through his work as a butcher (3/2-12).

⁶ For a study that contrasts several distinct uses of xu (emptiness) in the Zhuangzi, see Fraser (2008).

standpoint, captures all the relevant ideas in the *Zhuangzi*, or represents the best interpretation of each text considered. Nor do I contend that these ideas were intended by the original writers and editors to fit together in precisely the way I suggest. I claim only that the resulting position is one interesting, plausible way to assemble an ethical outlook from *Zhuangzi* material.

Applied to Zhuangist thought, then, Foucault's model might yield an account roughly like the following. The most conspicuous candidate in the *Zhuangzi* for the "ethical substance"—the part of ourselves that we attempt to modify, train, or develop through ethical practices—is probably the heart or mind (*xin* ©). In classical Chinese thought generally, the heart (*xin*) is the organ of cognition, the locus of emotion, and above all the part of the agent that guides action. Other aspects of the agent are clearly also of concern in Zhuangist ethical practices. For instance, emotional equanimity is a distinctive feature of the person of virtuosity (*de*) (see Fraser 2011 for details). Passages valorizing skills or addressing the challenges of political service make it clear that efficacious action is another focus. However, *Zhuangzi* discussions of both of these topics typically revolve around the operations of the heart (*xin*). Moreover, key passages describing ethical adepts emphasize their distinctive way of "applying the heart" (5/5, 7/32, 21/63), while others treat the heart as a focus of ethical development (4/26, 4/42–43, 19/62–64, 21/34–35). Still others identify improper use of the heart as a cause of ethical difficulties (1/42, 2/21–27, 4/24). The heart is thus manifestly an important ethical substance for *Zhuangzi* writers and may well be the primary one.

Exposition of the second and third Foucauldian elements in Zhuangist thought will be facilitated by first discussing the fourth, the "*telos*." Elsewhere, I have presented a detailed treatment of a Zhuangist eudaimonistic ideal that, borrowing the texts' own terminology, I

⁷ The heart's functions largely overlap with those we attribute to the mind, and so references to the heart in the *Zhuangzi* can also be interpreted as references to the mind. I have translated *xin* as "heart" mainly because the word also refers primarily to the physical organ in the chest.

label "wandering" (you) (Fraser 2014), along with an account of the emotional equanimity characteristic of wandering (Fraser 2011, 102–103). A distinctive characteristic of human agency is the capacity to discover, appreciate, and explore a plurality of distinct dao (ways or paths) within the totality of facts and processes that constitute the holistic Dao of the cosmos. "Wandering" refers to the mode of activity in which we employ this capacity effectively. It amounts to a second-order dao by which we explore the various first-order dao open to us—a meta-dao of recognizing and taking up potential paths presented by the interaction between agents' personal capacities and motivation and their objective circumstances. Virtuosity (de) is in effect agents' proficiency in resiliently, skillfully, and harmoniously wandering through the dao.

Wandering (you) is marked by cognitively aware, affectively calm, adaptive, and generally enjoyable or zestful activity (see Fraser 2014). Cognitively, the "wanderer" or Zhuangist virtuoso appreciates the order and patterns of nature, recognizing the vastness and duration of the cosmos, the continual transformation of things within it, the contingency and causal dependence of each thing upon others, and accordingly the conditional, limited nature of any path or project. Affectively, such a person maintains equanimity regarding his or her contingent, transitory circumstances. This equanimity is partly the product of cognitive and affective identification with the whole of nature and the process of change. These attitudes in turn yield an ability to adapt fluidly, creatively, and efficaciously to changing conditions, such that agents spontaneously find effective paths to follow, which they undertake in a spirit of ease and playfulness. Although the *Zhuangzi* rejects morality *per se* as a guide to action,

⁸ Oshima rightly emphasizes this point (1983. 67).

⁹ By a "first-order" *dao* here, I refer to a way of proceeding along some course of activity. A "second-order" *dao* is a more general way of selecting and undertaking various ways of proceeding with various activities. We can think of it as a way of following ways.

what we think of as morally right courses of action will often be endorsed in the guise of fitting or efficacious responses to circumstances.¹⁰

The *telos* of Zhuangist ethics, I suggest, is to fully develop our virtuosity (*de*) by realizing the wandering ideal through whatever concrete course of action comes spontaneously to us. An agent might be a woodcarver, a butcher, a diplomat, a ferry helmsman, a tutor—a wide range of activities can serve as fields for Zhuangist ethical achievement. Practitioners might strive simply to improve psycho-physiological health and excel at daily tasks, or they might eventually become sages or spiritual teachers, depending on their abilities and circumstances. The texts suggest no single vision of the good life. To the contrary, the implication is that different agents, with different capacities, may flourish in a variety of ways. Whatever the specifics of the practitioner's situation, he or she can engage in wandering as a mode of activity that various passages portray as central to psychophysiological health, personal flourishing, and judicious, efficacious action.

Foucault's second element, the "mode of subjection," answers for a particular ethical system the question of *why* the agent should engage in the work of reforming the ethical substance (O'Leary 2002, 13). In the context of Zhuangist ethics, the mode of subjection is in effect the self-conception that explains why agents should seek to reform their heart (*xin*) so as to realize the wandering life of virtuosity (*de*). The mode of subjection is probably partly aesthetic or attractive, in that wandering, virtuoso activity is depicted as admirable and efficacious, and partly teleological, in that it is depicted as best fulfilling our capacities and maintaining psycho-physiological health (Fraser 2011, 108). In the *Zhuangzi*, wandering is a conception of flourishing activity that emerges from reflection on a world of constant, uncontrollable flux, without absolute or universally applicable values, and the conviction that our creative ability to adapt calmly and efficaciously to changing circumstances is the finest,

¹⁰ Examples include the monkey keeper's compromise with his wards on the distribution of nuts (2/38–39) and

most distinctive feature of human agency (this theme is developed further in Fraser 2014). The human condition and natural environment are such that no single, fixed path is always appropriate, no fixed action-guiding distinctions are reliably efficacious, and events may not proceed as we expect. Against this background, wandering is considered an effective way of finding one's place in the cosmos—an approach to "nurturing our center" (4/53), or maintaining the inward ease and harmony characteristic of proper psychophysical hygiene, while smoothly responding to natural patterns and processes and "overcoming things without injury" (7/31–33). For the *Zhuangzi*, the mode of subjection involves neither obligation nor imperatives of human nature, however. Pursuing the ethical *telos* is not a duty, nor is it essential to human life. An agent who rejects or ignores the project of training the heart may live a suboptimal life or behave foolishly but does not thereby violate a moral requirement or fail to be fully human. Indeed, one passage implies that nature may place the ethical *telos* beyond the reach of some agents (5/31).

The remaining element in the Foucauldian scheme is the "ethical work." By what processes of training or cultivation do adherents seek to reshape themselves so as to approach the ethical *telos*? Zhuangist ethical ideals concern broad traits such as responsiveness, openness, and equanimity, rather than concrete judgments, habits, or conduct. Hence the texts generally do not spell out a specific ethical regimen or curriculum of personal cultivation, as some Ruist (Confucian) texts do, for instance. The relevant conception of ethical work does not yield particular steps, exercises, or formulae; it is more a process of training oneself to become more open-minded, spontaneous, or attentive. However, numerous passages do address ethical development, and some explicitly discuss how to overcome obstacles and make progress in self-cultivation. A shared theme of many such passages is that development

the policy that one should "feed a bird what nourishes a bird"—treat others as most appropriate for their needs, rather than our own (18/29-39, 19/72-76).

¹¹ See Fraser (2011, 103–105), which also sketches the early Chinese physiological beliefs underlying these views about psychophysiological hygiene.

ensues from clearing out the heart to attain a state of emptiness or blankness (xu), which both facilitates achievement of the ethical *telos* and is partly constitutive of it. The next section explores this conception of ethical work in detail.

Zhuangist Ethical Work

南), a task that a fictional Confucius assigns his student Yan Hui as a corrective to the latter's ambitious, elaborate strategies for reforming the headstrong, reckless tyrant of Wei. 12 (Their dialogue and several other passages bearing on ethical work cast Confucius as the writers' spokesman—a role that seems at least partly ironic, since the ideas presented are not typically associated with Confucianism and in some cases may be antithetical to it.) Yan first proposes a straightforward, aggressive approach, which Confucius rejects as forced and likely to invoke resistance. He next suggests an indirect, passive strategy, which Confucius rejects as ineffectual. Both approaches, Confucius remarks, amount to "taking the heart as instructor" (shi xin 与心) (4/24). In both cases, Yan is self-consciously preparing to deal with the tyrant according to fixed formulae determined in his heart, the organ that in classical Chinese thought was typically assumed to guide action. To move beyond these inadequate strategies, Confucius assigns Yan an explicit task of ethical work: he is to "fast" the heart to empty it of any preformed content. Confucius explains "heart-fasting" as follows:

Unify your intent (zhi \gtrsim). Listen not with the ears but with the heart; listen not with the heart but with qi \lessapprox (breath, ether). Listening stops at the ears; the heart stops at tallies. As to qi, it is what is empty (xu) and waits on things. Only take as your dao [the path of] gathering emptiness. Emptiness is the fasting of the heart. (4/26-28)

In response, Yan reports that before receiving this task, he solidly took himself to be himself, but after this assignment, it is as if he has never existed. Confucius responds that this loss of

self is precisely what he intends by "emptiness" (xu). He then encourages Yan to "wander in the tyrant's cage" without responding to his use of names. If the opportunity arises, Yan is to speak, but otherwise not. He should neither shut himself off nor force things along, but instead unify himself and dwell in "the inevitable" ($bu \ de \ yi \ \texttt{不得已}$). Rather than knowing by means of received knowledge, he is to know by means of lacking knowledge, allowing his senses to connect directly within him and putting himself outside the heart's cognitive processes.

The conceptual link the passage establishes between qi (breath) and emptiness (xu) has important implications for our interpretation of the latter. In early Chinese metaphysics, qi was the fluid-like "ether" from which everything was thought to be constituted. Objects were regarded as "solids" or "stuff" (shi 實) formed from coagulated or consolidated qi. Since qi is empty (xu), we can infer that emptiness (xu) does not refer to nothingness, non-existence, or utter vacuousness, the absence of anything whatsoever. Instead, it refers to the absence of completed "formation" (cheng 成) of things into solid, fixed forms. "Emptiness" (xu) is better interpreted along the lines of what is open and receptive, plastic or fluid, and unformed or insubstantial than what is vacant or non-existent. The directive to fast the heart thus entails abstaining from fixed, fully formed preconceptions that might guide action. Yan is to concentrate on the situation, but not by means of normal sense perception or the heart, which "stops at" or "fixates on" tallies (止於符). An ancient Chinese tally (fu 符) was a symbol of a covenant or of authority. Tallies were divided into two halves that fit together like puzzle pieces. To enforce or change the covenant or to verify one's authority, the holder of one piece of the tally had to match it to the other. Metaphorically, the implication is that the heart functions by using preformed signs that tally with exactly one sort of object, thus impeding

¹² The dialogue is at *Zhuangzi* (4/1–34). For a detailed discussion, see Fraser (2008).

For a discussion of this interpretation of the sentence, see Fraser (2008, 143, n. 13.)

the agent's ability to respond adaptively to a variety of objects. By contrast, qi is fluid or insubstantial and thus responsive to all things—it "waits on" them before flowing one way or another. To sum up, Yan should clear his heart of preconceived plans, attend fully to the situation, and let his qi respond to the concrete circumstances, yielding attuned, intuitive responses that issue not from the heart but from the person as a whole.¹⁴ Rather than relying on prior know-how to recognize and respond to things, he should employ an unformed, open receptivity to generate spontaneous responses to novel cases. A mark of this receptive, unformed state is a loss of conscious self-awareness.

As an instructive contrast with "heart-fasting" and "listening with qi," consider the story of Huizi's (Hui Shi 惠施) ineptitude at using his giant gourds (1/35–42). Having raised a crop of huge gourds, Huizi found them too big to make dippers and too heavy and unwieldy to be water containers. Concluding they were useless, he smashed them. His friend Zhuangzi ridicules his inability to see beyond the two most common uses for gourds, asking why he didn't make them into floats and go drifting on a river or lake. He attributes Huizi's lack of imagination to his "weed-choked" or "overgrown" heart. Unlike an empty heart, an "overgrown" one is incapable of creative adaptation to novelty.

A well-known passage about the perfected person's (*zhiren* 至人) use of the heart develops the concept of emptiness (xu) and clarifies the mode of activity supposed to issue from this psychological state.

Do not be the incarnation of a name; do not be a storehouse of schemes; do not undertake affairs; do not be a master of knowledge. Embody the limitless while wandering where there are no tracks; exhaust what you receive from nature without

¹⁴ Some aspects of heart-fasting seem remarkably similar to the process of "unconscious scanning" described by Ehrenzweig (1967), to which Kupperman (1999) calls attention. Ehrenzweig saw the creative process as constituted by three phases. First comes an initial state of "de-differentiation," in which we set aside any definite gestalt by which to organize perception. Then comes "unconscious scanning," which allows us to notice new possibilities by which to integrate patterns. Finally comes a state of re-differentiation, in which conscious awareness of a new whole emerges. Ehrenzweig's "de-differentiation" resembles the process of "fasting" or ceasing to "listen" with the heart, while his notion of "unconscious scanning" maps at least partly onto "listening with qi." "Re-differentiation" might correspond to the actions Yan Hui takes in response to opportunities discovered through "listening with qi."

any thought of gain—just be empty (xu), that's all. The perfected person's employment of the heart is like a mirror, neither sending off nor welcoming things, responding without storing. So he can overcome things without being harmed. (7/31-33)

This passage instructs us to set aside names or titles, schemes, ambitions, and received knowledge. We are to wander without boundaries or fixed labels for things, simply realizing our nature-given capacities without any thought of profit or achievement. The ensuing mode of agency is "like a mirror" in directly responding to the flow of events without welcoming them before they arrive, sending them away, or following after them when they depart. This mirroring characteristic purportedly yields practical efficacy.

The mirror metaphor can easily be pushed too far. The text does not imply that the perfected person has simply become a mirror, which automatically, objectively, yet passively reflects its environment without exercising agency—without any input of its own. The passage primarily concerns the mode of the ideal agent's action, not the content. The content of the response will depend on the material of the mirror and the circumstances reflected: a bronze mirror in twilight reflects differently from a glass one at noon, a convex mirror differently from a concave one. The emphasis of the metaphor here seems instead to be that the virtuoso responds to situations spontaneously, from a blank, fluid mindset, without fixating on or forming attachments to things. Because no ambitions, preferences, or fixed "limits" or "tracks" obstruct his heart, he can respond flexibly and fittingly. A mirror aptly symbolizes emptiness (*xu*) in that it reflects only if its surface is clear of dust and grime, it is always ready to reflect, and it neither anticipates nor binds itself to objects—when there is no object, there is no reflection. By analogy, emptiness (*xu*) supposedly allows us to employ

¹⁵ I thus reject the "radical" reading of this passage considered in Fraser (2008, 136–137). A similarly radical reading is broached in Yearley (1983, 134–136).

¹⁶ Graham, for instance, seems to systematically confuse these two dimensions (1989, 192–193). By contrast, Wenzel rightly calls attention to the limits of the mirror metaphor, remarking on the difficulty of extending the notion of unobscured, mirror-like awareness to the moral realm (2003, 121). As he emphasizes, what we can notice and respond to is always already interpreted by means of resources within us.

On "binding" as a hindrance to virtuoso action, see Fraser (2011, 103).

nature-given capacities without conscious ambition or distraction, clearing the heart so that we can respond promptly and directly to changing circumstances. The point here is how emptiness enables an open, "reflective" response that allows our capacities to function at their fullest. ¹⁸ Just what those capacities are and the content of their response will depend on our particular character, education, and abilities.

How exactly are we to empty the heart and allow it to respond freely and instantaneously, as a mirror does? Two further passages that explicitly treat ethical work provide hints about specific approaches. Assigned a risky, high-stakes diplomatic mission that could place his life in danger, Master Gao, the Duke of She, finds himself physically overcome with stress and consults Confucius, his mentor. Confucius notes that we all face inescapable decrees of fate and duty. Fate mandates that we be born into a family and care about our parents; duty entails that wherever we go, we find ourselves living under some political authority. Besides this service to kin and state, however, there is also self-cultivation, one's "service" to oneself:

As to serving your own heart, without sorrow or joy alternating before you, to know what you can't do anything about and be at peace with it as with fate, [this is] the ultimate in virtuosity (*de*). In being a political subject or son, there are bound to be things that are inevitable. Act on the reality of the situation and forget yourself. What leisure will you then have for delighting in life and hating death? (4/41–44)

Confucius goes on to offer detailed advice about managing communication and rivalry. He urges Master Gao to proceed with caution, neither compromising his assignment nor rushing to complete it, since compromised assignments and rushed completions are dangerous, while

18

in Book 2 of the *Zhuangzi* (2/30–31). The text states that the axis of *dao* is achieved when the action-guiding distinctions between *shi* 是 and *fei* 非 (this and that, right and wrong) cease to stand in opposition. The pivot can then rotate freely, "responding without end," such that anything can be deemed *shi* or *fei* temporarily for practical purposes. Fasting the heart, Fox proposes, amounts to clearing out the "socket" in which the hinge of *dao* rotates, allowing for unimpeded responsiveness. The text also links this responsiveness to light metaphors, such as "illuminating things with *tian* (sky, nature)" (2/29) and "applying illumination/understanding" (*yi ming* 以明) (2/31), thus drawing the discussion of the features and limitations of *shi-fei* distinctions into the same metaphorical space as the image of the clear, reflective mirror. Indeed, in the heart-fasting dialogue, Confucius implies that the empty heart gives off light, as a clear mirror does (4/32). Oshima aptly calls attention to how the sage's relationship to *dao* parallels the mirror's association with light (1983, 78).

fine accomplishments take time (4/51-52). The "ultimate" is to "let your heart wander (you) by riding along with things, and nurture your center by entrusting yourself to the inevitable" (4/52-53).

These instructions constitute a brief but rich depiction of the Zhuangist ethical *telos* and ethical work. Master Gao is to learn to recognize "the inevitable" (*bu de yi* 不得已) and accept it, finding his peace with it as he does with unchangeable features of his fate, such as his age, height, or birthplace. An outcome of this work will be emotional equanimity, a core aspect of virtuosity (*de*). By accepting and riding along with the inevitable, he can preserve his psycho-physiological equilibrium and maintain a clear, empty heart, which is ready to respond spontaneously, in no fixed direction, much as a mirror does. The specific technique by which to pursue this *telos* is to proceed according to the "facts" or "reality" (*qing* 情) of the affair in which he is engaged and "forget" (*wang* 忘) himself.

This guidance meshes well with that of the passages just considered. Each alludes to concentrating attention on the task at hand, accepting "the inevitable," and fluidly responding to changing circumstances. Each alludes to a process of emptying oneself of the preconceptions, concerns, and ambitions that typically drive action. Each depicts a form of "nurturing one's center," maintaining a loose, responsive equilibrium. A consequence of "heart-fasting" and blank, unstructured "listening" to things for Yan Hui was a loss of conscious self-awareness. Master Gao is explicitly told to forget about himself so that worries about self-preservation do not stress him and he can focus on his mission, responding freely to circumstances.

The theme of forgetting appears repeatedly in *Zhuangzi* passages dealing with ethical work. Another dialogue between Confucius and Yan Hui implies that forgetting is a concrete technique for achieving emptiness (6/89-93). Yan announces that he has made progress: he has forgotten moral goodness and duty (*ren yi* 仁義), two central Confucian virtues.

Confucius approves but indicates his work is still unfinished. At their next meeting Yan declares further progress: now he has forgotten rituals and music, two major concrete guidelines in Confucian ethics. Again Confucius approves but urges him to continue. On still another day Yan reports he has advanced again: "I sit and forget.... I let my limbs and torso fall away, dismiss hearing and vision, depart from bodily form and expel knowing, and assimilate to the Great Connection (*da tong* 大通)." Confucius praises him for identifying with the totality of natural transformations and thus having no preferences or constancy, being ready to adapt to anything. Yan has forgotten his originally professed values, the concrete norms of conduct he was trained in, and in the end even his own distinct existence apart from the flow of the cosmos. No self-awareness or concerns distract him from absorption in the ongoing course of events.

In another anecdote, Yan Hui admires a ferryman for his preternatural boat-handling. Confucius explains that a good swimmer or diver can easily become an adept helmsman, as he "forgets the water" (19/24). He is as at home on water as on land, so the fear of capsizing does not enter his heart (19/25), which can thus remain empty. When we are distracted by fears, extraneous concerns, or the stakes of our actions, our performance suffers:

Playing for tiles, you're skilled. Playing for silver buckles, you get the shakes. Playing for gold, you're a nervous wreck. Your skill is the same, but [in the latter two cases] there's something you care about; this is putting weight on something outside yourself. Anyone who puts weight on what's outside gets clumsy on the inside. (19/25–26)

By implication, then, "forgetting" here refers to emptying the heart of worries about or distractions from the "outside" so that we can maintain inward equilibrium and act freely and

¹⁹ The "Great Connection" could be an alternative way of alluding to the all-encompassing "Great *Dao*" (*da dao* 大道) of the cosmos, since the two phrases are linked conceptually: whereas "*dao*" refers to a path or way, "*tong*" can refer to connecting things by means of some path. Elsewhere, *Zhuangzi* writings refer to *Dao* as "connecting (*tong*) things as one" (道通為一) (2/35) and to the agent "connecting (*tong*) with *Dao*" (13/64) or "connecting (*tong*) with what creates things" (19/12).

adeptly, without impediments.²⁰ Yan Hui sits and forgets, removing preconceptions that might interfere with the appropriateness and efficacy of his responses; Master Gao and the ferryman forget concerns that might disrupt the smooth functioning of their abilities. The woodworker Qing, who sculpts bell-stands of unearthly beauty, explains that before starting a new piece he fasts to still his heart until all thoughts of praise or reward, rank or salary, honor or disgrace, and skill or clumsiness vanish. Ultimately, he too forgets even his limbs and body. His skill concentrated and outside distractions having drained away, he is able to discern wood of exceptional quality and match his unadulterated natural powers with the natural grain of the wood (19/54–59)—presumably an instance of a mirror-like response to things. This anecdote again emphasizes concentrating on a task, eliminating distractions, losing self-awareness, and responding efficaciously to circumstances.

"Forgetting" is not a prescription for utter mindlessness, however. Some *Zhuangzi* passages criticize agents for forgetting points that *should* guide their actions—for "hiding from nature and spurning reality, forgetting what one has received" (3/17) or for "forgetting oneself" (20/66) and "forgetting one's genuineness" in pursuit of profit (20/67). What distinguishes appropriate from inappropriate forgetting? A further passage offers a suggestion that ties together several of the themes examined so far:

The artisan Chui drew curves and angles that surpassed those made with the compass and set square. His fingers transformed along with things and he did not check them with the heart, so his soul-platform (*ling tai* 靈臺) was unified and unfettered. Forgetting your feet—this is your shoes fitting. Forgetting your waist—this is your belt fitting. Your cognition forgetting *shi* and *fei*—this is your heart fitting. Neither alternating inwardly nor getting drawn along outwardly—this is affairs and encounters fitting. To begin by fitting and never to have not fit—this is fitting so well that you forget all about fit. (19/62–64)

Chui performs efficaciously because his embodied skills transform along with the things he encounters, requiring no conscious monitoring from the heart. Hence he is psychologically

²⁰ In early Chinese physiology, worries or distractions were probably thought to present actual physiological obstructions to the normal, healthy flow of qi through the body and thus to fluid, effective action. See Fraser (2011, 104–106).

unified and unobstructed. By implication, the hallmark of the right sort of forgetting is practical efficacy, as indicated by a relation of "good fit" between the agent and the circumstances. Good fit both enables forgetting and identifies the appropriate sort of forgetting. It obtains when things are functioning smoothly and unobtrusively, causing us to forget them. Consciously attending to something indicates that activity is not proceeding smoothly; the heart is engaged in "checking" or "monitoring" and thus is no longer "empty." As virtuoso walkers, normally we need not attend to our shoes in order to stroll down a path. Similarly, the passage implies, if we are acting with virtuosity (*de*), we need not attend to *shi* (right) or *fei* (wrong) to determine what to do. Indeed, when all is functioning smoothly, we tend to "forget" things to the extent that distinctions between them vanish. The shoe that fits is not noticed as distinct from the foot; the normally functioning foot is not noticed as distinct from the leg or body. Indeed, the agent interacting adeptly with the environment often ceases to notice the body or self as distinct from the surroundings and so "forgets" self-awareness, as Yan Hui does when he "sits and forgets."

The passages cited treat different dimensions of forgetting. Some focus on how what is forgotten ceases to have any role in conscious action guidance. Master Gao is to forget himself so that worries about his safety no longer hinder his job performance. Yan Hui forgets ritual and music, which will no longer guide his social interactions. Other passages focus on how forgetting results from good fit. A belt that fits well is unobtrusive and thus forgotten. These two dimensions intersect, in that factors that are forgotten because of their good fit thereby also play no role in consciously guiding action, while conscious concerns, strategies, norms, and so forth that are better forgotten may prevent us from finding a good fit with our circumstances. The interplay between these dimensions is illustrated by the

²¹ Fox (1996) appropriately emphasizes the role of what he calls "finding the fit" in Zhuangist ethical practice and calls attention to skills as activities particularly devoted to achieving good fit.

²² Intriguingly, a prominent Zhuangist metaphor for ideal social relations is "forgetting each other" (*xiang wang* 相忘), as in the metaphor of fish living well by "forgetting each other in rivers and lakes" (6/23, 6/73).

swimmer or diver who can helm a boat because he "forgets the water." Worries about the water—fear of capsizing and drowning—are wholly absent from his heart precisely because of his good fit with the water—how at ease he is with it.

This example introduces a third dimension of forgetting: competence or mastery. The good swimmer or diver forgets the water because his swimming competence allows him to find an efficacious fit between his movements and the wet environment. Chui draws perfect curves and angles without his heart consciously verifying his movements because his craftsmanship enables his fingers to "transform along with things" and find the perfect fit. In mastering a skill, we both forget the explicit rules or steps by which we learned it and achieve an efficacious good fit with the objects of our skill—a fit so good that extraneous worries melt away. The empty mirror provides an apt analogy for both the seemingly automatic, instantaneous way a skilled virtuoso responds to her context and the blank, receptive state of "forgetting" from which her actions issue.

Skill mastery also helps to explain precisely how Zhuangist ethical work proceeds. The idea of ethical work as forgetting concerns and emptying the heart raises an obvious practical problem. Directly working at forgetting or emptying is a self-contradictory enterprise. Consciously, deliberately attempting to empty our attention or to forget something merely causes us to notice more acutely whatever it is we are doing or seeking to forget. Yet the emptiness, forgetting, and good fit the *Zhuangzi* depicts are familiar from the experience of learning and mastering skills. So just how do we forget? We can cultivate forgetting and emptiness by concentrating on challenging, world-guided skills that fill our attention and provide immediate performance feedback. Skilled tasks present us with "inevitable" conditions that lie beyond our control yet within which, with sufficient sensitivity and responsiveness, we can find openings to proceed. We begin with explicit steps or movements in mind but eventually "forget" these and learn to act from a blank, empty state in which we

concentrate on the task at hand without focusing on any one thing in particular. We come to experience action as a spontaneous response to our context, rather than the result of self-conscious cognition and deliberation. As the masterful butcher Cook Ding says, "I encounter it with my spirit, rather than looking with my eyes. Perceptual knowing ceases, while spirit proceeds" (3/6).

To wrap up this section, my interpretive proposal is that for a major thread of Zhuangist thought, the concrete ethical work, in Foucault's sense, lies in training ourselves to attain a state of "emptiness" (xu) by regularly engaging in challenging, world-guided activities in which we "forget" rules, distractions, concerns, and even our own identity while seeking "good fit" between our actions and the environment. To help achieve such emptiness, we might try "sitting and forgetting"—probably a form of apophatic meditation—under a garden tree or while floating in a raft on a lake. We might reflect on the rhetoric of the *Zhuangzi* itself, such as the many aporetic arguments or the stories depicting diverse, uncommon perspectives.²³ Above all, we can learn and exercise skills, which offer ready, concrete opportunities to apply emptiness, forgetting, and spontaneous, mirror-like responses to practical challenges.

Emptiness and Flow

The "empty" state I have been describing, along with its relation to skills, brings to mind the "autotelic" or intrinsically rewarding state of total absorption in challenging, goal-directed activities that Csikszentmihalyi (1990) has dubbed "flow." Indeed, Csikszentmihalyi himself discusses the *Zhuangzi* and the example of Cook Ding the butcher (1990, 150). Flow for Csikszentmihalyi is the crux of what he calls "optimal experience" and hence a cornerstone of a well-lived life. I have been suggesting that attaining emptiness constitutes the major

ethical work leading to the Zhuangist ethical telos. Elsewhere I have also proposed that it is a substantive element of the Zhuangist conception of the good life (Fraser 2008, 132–135). To what extent do Csikszentmihalyi's concept of flow and the Zhuangist notion of empty, "forgetful," yet fitting activity converge?

Csikszentmihalyi identifies several key factors characteristic of "flow."²⁴ It is an intrinsically rewarding or enjoyable state involving intense concentration on the present instant, a loss of reflective self-consciousness, a fusing of action and awareness, an altered experience of time (which may seem to pass more slowly or quickly than usual), and a sense of control over one's situation. Preconditions for flow are that the agent be engaged in an activity with clear goals, which provide straightforward, immediate performance feedback, and that the challenges of the activity balance the agent's competence, such that the agent can realistically be confident of success. The activities I have suggested constitute Zhuangist ethical work clearly involve deep concentration, loss of self-awareness, and the agent's merging with her actions and environment. At least some are intrinsically rewarding—Cook Ding, for instance, mentions the satisfaction that ensues from his work (3/11).

However, the Zhuangist stance on the role of control, confidence, and goals seems nearly antithetical to Csikszentmihalyi's account of flow. ²⁵ For Csikszentmihalyi, flow experiences are a way for agents to impose a satisfying, self-fulfilling order on psychological chaos. In the Zhuangzi, by contrast, emptiness, forgetting, and discussions of skill seem directed at acknowledging and accepting chaos, whether psychological or external to the agent. We are to learn to accept and cope with unforeseeable change and "the inevitable," or circumstances

²³ For samples of aporetic argumentation, see *Zhuangzi* Book 2, "Discourse on Evening Things Out," and 17, "Autumn Waters." For stories contrasting different perspectives, see Book 1, "Meanderingly Wandering."

For analytic characterizations of "flow," see Csikszentmihalyi (1990, 49) and Nakamura and Csikszentmihalyi (2009, 195–196).

Depictions of flow-like activities in the *Zhuangzi* also do not emphasize a distorted experience of time.

over which we have no control.²⁶ Rather than bring order to chaos, we give up our presuppositions about order and adapt fluidly to change. Some passages depict the ethical work as leading to a state of psychological constancy—a "constant heart" (*chang xin* 常心, 5/9). But this constancy is achieved by relinquishing our sense of a self that controls its own fate and pursues its own fixed goals. It arises from maintaining an empty, responsive state that depends on nothing in particular (1/21) and by identifying with the totality of the course of nature (5/7–8, 21/31–35). For the *Zhuangzi*, the human condition is that we continually face uncontrollable, unpredictable processes of "creation and transformation" (*zao hua* 造化), which may cause existing skills to lose purchase or previously defined goals to evaporate. The point of emptiness and mirroring is that they prime us to spontaneously find a new "fit" even when we cannot be confident that any of our existing values, goals, or skills will remain applicable.

Critical Reflections

Emptiness (*xu*) and mirroring are metaphorical, not literal notions. "Heart-fasting" and "forgetting" can of course never fully purge the agent of assumptions and habits, nor take us beyond registering things by means of some aspect of the system of "tallies" we have learned to employ. At most they can only loosen the grip of received habits of thought or action and prime us to modify or replace them. They may help us achieve a more transparent state of consciousness, in which attention is directed more fully and sensitively toward our context, while plans, distractions, and self-reflexive awareness fade away. They do not really empty us out entirely, however, or we would lack the resources by which to register and respond to

²⁶ Jochim (1998, 64–65) rightly emphasizes that control is absent from Zhuangist treatments of the flow experience and that the heterogeneous, fluid, chaotic conception of the person in the *Zhuangzi* fits poorly with Csikszentmihalyi's ideal (1990, 214–215) of bringing order and purpose to one's life by self-consciously organizing it into a unified series of flow experiences. On the Zhuangist conception of self, see too Fraser (2013). On the uncontrolled or chaotic sources of the self in *Zhuangzi*, see Kupperman (1999).

things. A wholly empty mirror would be a hollow frame, unable to reflect at all. Nor are mirror-like responses pure reflections. Our intuitions and skills continue to guide action, albeit unconsciously and with a heightened sensitivity to novel, creative paths. Our responses are not passive "mirrorings," but reactions, grounded in tacit interpretations of what we encounter. Zhuangist emptiness (xu) is not wholesale psychological nothingness, but a state similar to that of a jazz player improvising a solo, both taking cues and inciting responses from the other musicians. Self-awareness and self-conscious cognition—aspects of our psychology attributed to the xin (heart, mind) and $zhi \not\approx$ (knowing, understanding, cognition)—are absent or marginalized. But deeper, unconscious sources of agency continue to function, denoted by terms such as qi (breath), $shen \not\approx$ (spirit), or $ling tai \not\cong \not\equiv$ (soul platform). Indeed, the Zhuangzi highlights how intelligent, adept action often springs chiefly from such other aspects of the agent.

A further respect in which this cluster of metaphors might mislead concerns the objects "reflected" in the heart's mirror-like functioning. As Wenzel observes (2003, 122), the circumstances the Zhuangist agent must be aware of include not only what is outside the agent, but the agent's own dispositions, abilities, and possibilities for action. The most fitting path for Cook Ding to slice up the ox or the phantom-like whitewater swimmer to navigate the rapids (19/49–54) is determined partly by the natural structures they face, partly by their relation to those structures and their ongoing movement. To find an effective course, the empty, mirroring heart must respond in ways that stem partially from an awareness of the self and its relation to the environment, even if this awareness is unconscious. The virtuoso's activity thus cannot simply be a reflection of or response to her context. It must be partly a projection of her self-understanding and goal-directedness—albeit a fluid, responsive self-understanding and directedness, not the rigid, predetermined attitudes supposedly purged through "heart-fasting."

Hansen's analysis helps to clarify these points (1992, 300–302). In the performance of advanced skills, self-conscious, deliberate decision-making vanishes, since it would only interfere with performance. Complex sequences of activity become compressed into a single basic action. We become so at ease performing a skill that we forget the discrete, constituent actions by which we learned it. We no longer think about moving our fingers one by one to strike the keys; we simply perform the sonata. We no longer concentrate on rotating our legs to link a series of turns; we just ski down the trail. Phenomenologically, our actions can come to seem like spontaneous reflexes triggered by the environment, reflections in an empty mirror. In fact, however, as Hansen points out, we are experiencing the high-level functioning of an advanced skill structure.

These reflections raise the question of whether Zhuangist ethical work can truly be effective in achieving the ethical *telos* of wandering (*you*) with virtuosity (*de*). Wandering entails a creative openness to a plurality of ways of going on, some of which might be radically different from what we are accustomed to. Perhaps immersion in skills to the extent that we perform them automatically or unconsciously might instead lock us into habits and preconceptions, breeding cognitive sclerosis or blindness to anything that does not fit neatly into the existing framework of our skill. If spontaneous responses issuing from the empty (*xu*) state are actually grounded in habit, prior training, and our existing self-understanding, how can we distinguish insensitive, heedless responses from sensitive, adaptive ones? How can an agent confirm she is not being guided by baseless or suboptimal prejudices?

One possible criterion for these distinctions is practical efficacy. On reaching a knotty juncture, Cook Ding pauses, concentrates, and allows his intuitive skill structure to spontaneously move the knife through the ox's body, thus advancing beyond his original level of skill. Supposedly, his response is appropriate because he succeeds in slicing up the meat. Yet perhaps a more fitting response would be to recognize that he has encountered this

obstacle only because he is mutilating the corpse of a fellow creature, one who would surely have preferred to remain alive and in one piece. Efficacious as his response may seem, a more adroit reaction might be to change careers and stop killing harmless animals. Efficacy does not ensure that a course of action is fitting, since we can question whether the task at which an agent is so successful is one he should be performing at all.

This line of critical questioning highlights a genuine challenge, but one I suggest the Zhuangist conception of ethical work has the resources to cope with, provided we clarify its aims and purposes. The texts we have examined do not imply that empty mirroring is an end in itself or that the recipe for attaining the ethical *telos* is simply to master one or more skills. Nor do they suggest there is some general "skill of life" that one can master in the way the ferryman has mastered boat handling or the cicada-catcher has acquired the trick of plucking cicadas from trees with a pole (19/17–21). They do not promise easy or direct solutions to thorny practical questions, such as whether to slaughter oxen or become a vegetarian. To the contrary, several passages—such as the discussion of Master Gao's mission—underscore the difficulty and complexity of practical issues. Identifying and overcoming ethical blind spots is a persisting challenge, to which neither the *Zhuangzi* nor any other ethical approach can ensure a solution.

The implication is rather that learning how to approach a challenging assignment such as Master Gao's or to master a skill such as Cook Ding's illustrates key elements of ethical work and thus "how to cultivate life," as Lord Wen Hui, Ding's employer, remarks (3/12). This ethical work is an ongoing process of developing greater sensitivity to our circumstances, cultivating a calm, centered constitution that allows us to notice and respond to opportunities rather than force things along, and allowing room for novel, effective responses that shatter existing biases, assumptions, and limitations. The process offers no guarantees. But it seems plausible that continued ethical work along these lines can help us

become more sensitive, responsive, and creative and thus make incremental progress toward the ethical *telos*. Indeed, since the Zhuangist approach encourages practitioners to look beyond received paths of thought and conduct and consider alternatives, it seems at least conducive to greater ethical awareness. Cook Ding may not have appreciated that oxen would prefer to live in peace, but elsewhere in the *Zhuangzi* a ritual priest observes that his pigs would rather munch chaff and bran in their pen than dine on choice grain only to later be slaughtered as sacrificial offerings (19/35–38). All one can do is persevere in the ethical work, treating life as a field not just for performing skills but for continually extending, refining, and challenging them.

References

- Csikszentmihalyi, Mihaly. (1990). *Flow: The Psychology of Optimal Experience*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Ehrenzweig, Anton. (1967). *The Hidden Order of Art*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Foucault, Michel. (1988). *The History of Sexuality*, volume II, *The Use of Pleasure*. R. Hurley, tr. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- Foucault, Michel. (1984). "On the Genealogy of Ethics: An Overview of Work in Progress." In *The Foucault Reader*, P. Rabinow, ed., 340–372. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Fox, Alan. (1996). "Reflex and Reflectivity: *Wuwei* in the *Zhuangzi*." *Asian Philosophy* 6.1: 59–72.
- Fraser, Chris. (2014). "Wandering the Way: A Eudaimonistic Approach to the *Zhuangzi*." Forthcoming in *Dao: A Journal of Comparative Philosophy*.

- Fraser, Chris. (2013). "Landscape, Travel, and a Daoist View of the 'Cosmic Question'." In *Landscape and Travelling East and West: A Philosophical Journey*, H. Moeller and A. Whitehead, eds. London: Bloomsbury Academic (in press).
- Fraser, Chris. (2011). "Emotion and Agency in the *Zhuangzi*." *Asian Philosophy* 21.1: 97–121.
- Fraser, Chris. (2008). "Psychological Emptiness in the *Zhuangzi*." *Asian Philosophy* 18.2: 123–47.
- Graham, A. C. (1989). Disputers of the Tao. La Salle: Open Court.
- Graham, A. C. (1981). Chuang-tzu: The Inner Chapters. London: George Allen & Unwin.
- Hansen, Chad. (1992). *A Daoist Theory of Chinese Thought*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Jochim, Chris. (1998). "Just Say 'No' to 'No Self' in *Zhuangzi*." In *Wandering at Ease in the* Zhuangzi, Roger Ames, ed., 35–74. Albany: SUNY Press.
- Kupperman, Joel. (1999). Learning from Asian Philosophy. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Nakamura, Jeanne, and Csikszentmihalyi, Mihalyi. (2009). "Flow Theory and Research." In *Oxford Handbook of Positive Psychology*, 2nd ed., C. R. Snyder and S. J. Lopez, eds., 195–206. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- O'Leary, Timothy. (2002). Foucault and the Art of Ethics. London: Continuum.
- Oshima, Harold. (1983). "A Metaphorical Analysis of the Concept of Mind in the *Chuang-tzu*." In *Experimental Essays on Chuang-tzu*, V. Mair, ed. (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press), 63–84.
- Wenzel, Christian. (2003). "Ethics and Zhuangzi: Awareness, Freedom, and Autonomy." *Journal of Chinese Philosophy* 30.1: 115–26.
- Yearley, Lee. (1983). "The Perfected Person in the Radical Chuang-tzu." In *Experimental Essays on Chuang-tzu*, V. Mair, ed. (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press), 125–139.

Zhuangzi. (1956). A Concordance to Zhuangzi 莊子引得, Harvard-Yenching Institute

Sinological Index Series, Supplement no. 20. Cambridge, Ma.: Harvard University Press.